Transfer Monitoring Report

2016 – 2020
(Cycle 22)

CORE THEME II: Transfer and Academic Preparation

Objective 2: Offer courses and support for students to meet the requirements for transfer from Lower Columbia College.

Objective 3: Provide the support for transfer students to successfully transition to upper division college and university programs.

February 17, 2021

Transfer Monitoring Report

Lower Columbia College's Key Performance Indicators were initially established in 1999 through a strategic planning process. The framework was updated in 2007, and revised in 2011 with the adoption of the Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities new standards for accreditation.

Key Performance Indicators for the Transfer Monitoring Report include:
- Student performance
- Transfer readiness
- Demonstration of General Education Outcomes
- Academic transfer rate
- Academic success of transfer students after transfer
- Relevance of programs

Transfer enrollment data is also included in this report.

Some of the actions that have come about as a result of past reviews of the Transfer Monitoring Report include:

- This academic year (20-21) LCC has developed a new partnership with Franklin University out of Ohio. Franklin has been a long standing transfer articulation partner and reached out to LCC as part of a new initiative to improve relationships with community and technical colleges nationwide. Development of transfer pathways in various disciplines are currently in the works and will continue throughout this academic year.
- LCC continues to explore additional BAS degrees in areas such as Organizational Leadership and Technical Management.
- Biology faculty are continuing their development of community college undergraduate research experiences (CUREs) in and across courses/programs and looking at ways to integrate it into online biology courses. The Biology faculty are also participating in a collaborative grant application with WSU-V and Clark college faculty, although this has been held up by the funding organization due to COVID. If funded, this project will aim to improve the transfer pathway for community college students with a specific aim to increase the number of underrepresented students transferring to WSU-V. Biology faculty are also actively involved in the Washington State STEM Communities of Practice that emerged out of the COVID pandemic and modality shift to online STEM Instruction. The STEM Communities of Practice are faculty-driven learning collectives designed to help the system lead with racial equity by supporting educators in creating significant and equitable learning environments for students in STEM.

- Math faculty continue to develop an accelerated precollege sequence for STEM and Business pathways. Mathematics placement and refresher courses in Canvas are also being updated to reflect the reduction in pre-college courses. Implementation of new courses and curricula will be rolled out starting in the summer 2021 quarter.
- Guided Pathways work continues:
    - LCC's new College Success course (COLL 101) has been piloted this fall and winter quarter 2020-21. Starting summer 2021 it will be a graduation requirement for new students with fewer than 30 credits. An openly licensed textbook has been adopted and modified for use in the course.
    - Pathway maps have been completed and will be available to students July 2021.
- Language and literature faculty piloted a co-requisite English 101 course: English 101 Plus. Students who could be successful in English 101 with additional support are enrolled in English 98 or 99 and a section of 101. The co-requisite model, along with smaller class sizes, allows for high-touch instructor support. Data is being collected to determine impact and effectiveness of the Plus model.

(Mission Fulfillment = 78% for all categories)
(Stretch Goal = 85% for all categories)

**Table 1: Proportion of transfer students achieving satisfactory academic performance
in academic transfer courses**

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
Proportion of students receiving grades of C or better in Academic classes numbered 100 and above. Grades excluded: I, N, R, NA, V, X and *.	83.4%	84.3%	82.6%	81.1%	80.3%
Male	82.3%	83.9%	81.4%	77.4%	78.2%
Female	84.3%	85.0%	83.7%	83.1%	81.5%
Students of Color	80.3%	83.3%	82.8%	76.4%	76.0%
Economically Disadvantaged	81.5%	80.5%	81.2%	77.6%	78.0%

Source: Fact book; Select Kind of Student = T from Student Table, link to Transcripts for relevant year where grades not like I, N, R, V, X or NA; select dept_div, course num, gr, item and yrq; link to Class table using item and yrq to select INSTIT_INTENT_RECAT = "A" (Academic Courses) from Class table. Note: as of 2017-18, P grades included as successful grade.

- The proportion of students successfully completing academic transfer courses declined in 2019-20, but still met mission fulfillment.

Key Performance Indicator:
Demonstration of General Education Outcomes (Global Skills)
(Mission Fulfillment = 3.0)
(Stretch Goal = 3.8)

Table 2: Average Scores, General Education Outcomes (Global Skills)

	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
Communication	--	--	2.9	--	--
Critical Thinking	--	3.1	--	--	--
Interpersonal Relations	2.9	--	--	--	--
Quantitative Literacy (Numeracy)	--	--	--	3.1	3.1

- Artifacts are collected throughout each academic year in preparation for the annual summer assessment institute. Artifacts are assessed using rubrics developed by LCC faculty on a scale of 1 (low) to 5 (high). LCC faculty readers for the institute are selected through a competitive application process.
- LCC faculty repeated Quantitative Literacy two years in a row while a new rubric was piloted and subsequently adopted.
- Due to the COVID pandemic, there was not an annual summer assessment institute in 2019-20.

Lower Columbia College's Global Skills (General Education Outcomes)

Communication--Express ideas and information in writing and speaking in a manner that is clear and appropriate to the audience, and read and listen effectively.
    A. *Students will communicate in complete sentences, demonstrating use of grammar, mechanics, and word choice appropriate to context.*
    B. *Students will develop and express their ideas clearly and reasonably for a unified purpose.*
    C. *Students will demonstrate comprehension of a wide variety of materials.*
    D. *Students will use credible evidence to support arguments and conclusions.*
    E. *Students will document source information.*
    F. *Students will use a style of delivery that is effective in communicating their message.*

Critical Thinking--Apply various techniques and processes using information, data, situations, or other forms of artistic expression, to draw logical, rational, ethical, and coherent conclusions.
    A. *Students will identify and define primary problems or issues.*
    B. *Students will gather relevant and accurate information and draw valid inferences from that information.*
    C. *Students will be able to analyze and make judgments in response to problems, issues, and artistic expression using technique or processes appropriate to subject.*
    D. *Students will propose and/or evaluate solutions based on the criteria of logic, ethical principles, and coherence.*

Interpersonal Skills--Interact effectively with individuals and/or within groups.
    A. *Students will participate actively, demonstrating commitment to shared tasks.*
    B. *Students will cooperate with others.*
    C. *Students will use verbal and non-verbal skills appropriate for the context to enhance collaboration.*

Quantitative Literacy (QL) -- also known as Numeracy or Quantitative Reasoning (QR) – is a "habit of mind," competency, and comfort in working with numerical data.
    A. *Students will explain information presented in mathematical forms (e.g., equations, graphs, diagrams, tables, words).*
    B. *Students will convert relevant information into various mathematical forms (e.g., equations, graphs, diagrams, tables, words).*
    C. *Students will perform mathematical calculations.*
    D. *Students will make judgments and draw appropriate conclusions based on the quantitative analysis of data, while recognizing the limits of this analysis.*
    E. *Students will make and evaluate important assumptions in estimation, modeling, and data analysis*
    F. *Students will express quantitative evidence in support of the argument or purpose of the work (in terms of what evidence is used and how it is formatted, presented, and contextualized).*

<p align="center">Key Performance Indicator: <u>Transfer Readiness</u></p>
<p align="center">(Mission Fulfillment = at or above the system rate for all categories)</p>
<p align="center">(Stretch Goal = 5% above the system rate* for all categories)</p>

In 2019-20, the State Board for Community and Technical Colleges (SBCTC) consolidated student cohort tracking methodology to focus on First-Time Entering Students. Historically, 45 credits has been considered a notable milestone in terms of transfer preparedness and is a momentum point in the state's Student Achievement Initiative (performance-funding model).

<p align="center">Table 3: Percent of Transfer Students Achieving 45 College Level Credits within 2 Years
(First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Metrics)</p>

Cohort year	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
LCC Rate: Overall	**46%**	**52%**	**55%**	**51%**	**53%**
System Rate^: Overall	45%	46%	47%	47%	47%
LCC Rate: Female	49%	55%	55%	53%	57%
System Rate^: Female	46%	47%	49%	48%	50%
LCC Rate: Male	42%	49%	53%	47%	44%
System Rate^: Male	43%	44%	44%	45%	45%
LCC Rate: Students of Color	43%	49%	60%	49%	44%
System Rate^: Students of Color	42%	44%	45%	45%	47%
LCC Rate: Received Need-Based Aid	33%	45%	41%	40%	34%
System Rate^: Received Need-Based Aid	40%	40%	41%	41%	42%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, Credit Milestones view, 45 Credits Year 2 milestone.
Includes all student cohort groups, transfer only students, summer/fall entry quarters.
*percentage points.   ^All Other Colleges.

Key Performance Indicator: Academic Transfer Rate
(Mission Fulfillment = within 5% of system rate* for all categories)
(Stretch Goal = meet or exceed system rate for all categories)

In 2019-20, the State Board for Community and Technical Colleges (SBCTC) consolidated student cohort tracking methodology to focus on First-Time Entering Students. The figures below show the proportion of students who transferred to a four-year institution within four-years of starting at LCC.

Table 4: Percent of Transfer Students who Transfer to a 4-Year College (Four Years after Start) (First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Metrics)

Cohort year	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17
LCC Rate: Overall	**32%**	**38%**	**36%**	**38%**	**40%**
System Rate^: Overall	36%	37%	38%	39%	39%
LCC Rate: Female	33%	39%	39%	40%	45%
System Rate^: Female	37%	39%	40%	41%	41%
LCC Rate: Male	31%	37%	31%	35%	31%
System Rate^: Male	35%	36%	36%	37%	36%
LCC Rate: Students of Color	33%	31%	35%	41%	46%
System Rate^: Students of Color	34%	34%	36%	37%	36%
LCC Rate: Received Need-Based Aid	16%	26%	22%	25%	24%
System Rate^: Received Need-Based Aid	25%	26%	26%	27%	26%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, Post-College view, Year 4 – Transfer 4yr College.
Includes all student cohort groups, transfer only students, summer/fall entry quarters.
*percentage points.   ^All Other Colleges.

Table 5: Where Did They Go?
Transfer destinations of students enrolled in 2019-20 (all transfer students)

- Arizona State University (2)
- Bellevue College* (3)
- Bellevue University (1)
- Biola University (1)
- Boise State University (6)
- Brigham Young University - Idaho Spring/Fall (1)
- Brigham Young University (1)
- Bushnell University (1)
- California Polytechnic State University (1)
- Central Washington University (24)
- Centralia College* (3)
- City University Of Seattle (2)
- Columbia Basin College (1)
- Columbia Southern University (1)
- Concordia University At St Paul (1)
- Concordia University Portland (1)
- Concordia University Portland (1)
- Dominican University Of California (1)
- Eastern Kentucky University (1)
- Eastern Oregon University (1)
- Eastern Washington University (6)
- George Fox University (1)
- Grand Canyon University (1)
- Grand Canyon University-Traditional (3)
- Humboldt State University (1)
- Lake Washington Institute Of Technology (1)
- Lewis & Clark College Of Arts & Sciences (2)
- Lewis-Clark State College (3)
- Louisiana State University - Ag (2)
- McPherson College (1)
- Multnomah University (1)
- Northern State University (1)
- Northwest Nazarene University (2)
- Northwest University (2)
- Olympic College* (1)
- Oregon Institute Of Technology (2)
- Oregon State University (2)
- Pacific Lutheran University (1)
- Peninsula College* (2)
- Point Loma Nazarene University (1)
- Portland State University (3)
- Saint Martin's University (1)
- Seattle Central College (1)
- Seattle Pacific University (1)
- Skagit Valley College (2)
- Southern Utah University (1)
- The Evergreen State College (1)
- University Of Alabama Birmingham-Traditional (1)
- University Of Alaska Anchorage (1)
- University Of Charleston (1)
- University Of Idaho (1)
- University Of Phoenix (1)
- University Of Washington - Seattle (20)
- Warner Pacific College (12)
- Washington State University (67)
- Western Governors University (9)
- Western Washington University (7)
- Westmont College (1)

*Baccalaureate program

Key Performance Indicator: Relevance of Programs
(Mission Fulfillment = 60%)
(Stretch Goal = 65%)

Table 6: Graduation Rate of LCC Transfer Students at 4-Year Transfer Institutions

Grad Year	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
Grad Rate of LCC transfer students at transfer institutions	51.0%	62.9%	62.0%	67.3%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Cohorts (FTEC) for student cohorts (All cohorts, summer/fall start, transfer students), and National Student Clearinghouse for graduate information.

- Information reported above includes first-time entering LCC transfer students that transferred to a 4-year institution after attending LCC. The above table allows students eight years from when they started at LCC to graduate at a 4-year institution.

Transfer Enrollment Data

Table 7: Enrollment and Graduation Data

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
Unduplicated headcount, all funding sources	1946	1980	1997	2000	1959
Transfer student population as a percent of all students	27%	30%	29%	31%	33%
FTE by institutional intent (fall quarter, state funded)	937	917	989	969	978
FTE as percent of institutional FTE (fall quarter, state funded)	37%	41%	43%	45%	45%
Transfer associate degrees granted	460	455	437	459	401

Data Source: FACT BOOK, Data Warehouse, Registration Office for degrees granted; FTE – Class Table (FTES_State, YRQ, Dept_Div, Course_Num, Item, Instit_Intent_Recat = A)

- Headcount of transfer students increased 0.9% in 2019-20.
- The decline in transfer enrollment and the number of transfer degrees granted in 2019-20 was likely due at least in part to the COVID pandemic.

College Level English & Math Completion (Transfer Students)

Table 8a: College Level English Completion in First Year

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
LCC Rate: Overall	**73%**	**69%**	**64%**	**66%**	**69%**
Full-time	79%	78%	71%	71%	76%
Part-time	59%	49%	46%	54%	45%
Male	68%	65%	63%	61%	67%
Female	76%	72%	64%	68%	71%
Need-Based Aid*	60%	51%	43%	46%	59%
System Rate^: Overall	59%	60%	57%	61%	62%
Full-time	69%	70%	68%	71%	72%
Part-time	44%	45%	42%	46%	46%
Male	57%	58%	55%	59%	60%
Female	61%	63%	59%	63%	64%
Need-Based Aid*	53%	52%	50%	51%	50%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, located at https://www.sbctc.edu/colleges-staff/collegeaccess/research-data/first-time-entering-student-outcomes-dashboard.aspx. Credit Milestones View (All cohorts, Transfer students, summer/fall start). See dashboard for "n" size, college access only.
*Students who received need-based aid.   ^All Other Colleges.

Table 8b: College Level English Completion in First Year by Race/Ethnicity

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
LCC Rate: Overall	**73%**	**69%**	**64%**	**66%**	**69%**
American Indian or Alaska Native	57%	50%	50%	56%	66%
Asian	85%	83%	62%	54%	46%
Black or African American	75%	42%	48%	46%	80%
Hispanic or Latino	73%	89%	67%	65%	78%
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*
White	74%	68%	66%	67%	70%
System Rate^: Overall	59%	60%	57%	61%	62%
American Indian or Alaska Native	50%	51%	50%	54%	52%
Asian	63%	66%	60%	65%	68%
Black or African American	50%	52%	49%	54%	56%
Hispanic or Latino	57%	58%	56%	59%	60%
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	59%	55%	56%	58%	58%
White	60%	61%	59%	62%	63%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, located at https://www.sbctc.edu/colleges-staff/collegeaccess/research-data/first-time-entering-student-outcomes-dashboard.aspx. Credit Milestones View (All cohorts, Transfer students, summer/fall start). See dashboard for "n" size, college access only.
*Less than 10 students; redacted to protect student privacy.   ^All Other Colleges.

Table 9a: College Level Math Completion in First Year

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
LCC Rate: Overall	**29%**	**31%**	**29%**	**29%**	**33%**
Full-time	34%	38%	35%	34%	37%
Part-time	19%	16%	15%	16%	21%
Male	32%	35%	31%	28%	41%
Female	27%	28%	28%	29%	28%
Need-Based Aid*	19%	22%	26%	23%	27%
System Rate^: Overall	32%	32%	33%	34%	36%
Full-time	38%	39%	40%	41%	43%
Part-time	22%	22%	23%	23%	23%
Male	35%	35%	36%	37%	39%
Female	30%	31%	31%	32%	33%
Need-Based Aid*	27%	27%	29%	30%	32%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, located at https://www.sbctc.edu/colleges-staff/collegeaccess/research-data/first-time-entering-student-outcomes-dashboard.aspx. Credit Milestones View (All cohorts, Transfer students, summer/fall start). See dashboard for "n" size, college access only.
*Students who received need-based aid.   ^All Other Colleges.

Table 9b: College Level Math Completion in First Year by Race/Ethnicity

	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20
LCC Rate: Overall	**29%**	**31%**	**29%**	**29%**	**33%**
American Indian or Alaska Native	18%	25%	32%	24%	31%
Asian	41%	56%	33%	43%	21%
Black or African American	10%	42%	17%	17%	27%
Hispanic or Latino	24%	32%	21%	17%	35%
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*
White	29%	30%	30%	29%	33%
System Rate^: Overall	32%	32%	33%	34%	36%
American Indian or Alaska Native	23%	22%	24%	30%	29%
Asian	44%	44%	45%	47%	48%
Black or African American	23%	23%	22%	25%	26%
Hispanic or Latino	24%	25%	27%	28%	29%
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	27%	30%	27%	27%	29%
White	32%	33%	34%	34%	36%

Source: SBCTC First-Time Entering Student Outcomes Dashboard, located at https://www.sbctc.edu/colleges-staff/collegeaccess/research-data/first-time-entering-student-outcomes-dashboard.aspx. Credit Milestones View (All cohorts, Transfer students, summer/fall start). See dashboard for "n" size, college access only.
*Less than 10 students; redacted to protect student privacy.   ^All Other Colleges.

Transfer Monitoring Report
Analysis from the Review Team

Members include: Melinda Harbaugh and Karen Joiner, co-chairs, Dawn Draus, Jim Franz, Traci Fuller, Stefanie Gilberti, Mary Hebert, Lindsay Keevy, Louis LaPierre, Allison McCrady, Joanna Mosser, Lucas Myers, Shawnee Randolph, Mavourneen Rister, Ilinca Slabu, Jenny Smith, Jim Stanley, Maggie Stuart, Ian Triana, Niki Walker, Annette Ward.

1. **Based on the data in this report, what are LCC's strengths in providing transfer education?**
   - Our transfer students are getting bachelor's degrees, as indicated by the strong graduation rate from their transfer institutions.
   - Overall, LCC is at or above the system rate across all indicators. Although there are a few demographic groups in need of improvement, generally we are meeting or exceeding system averages.
   - The new college success course that we're implementing in summer 2021 will help us identify demographic groups who are at-risk.
   - We are consistently outperforming the system in terms of achievement of 45 college level credits within two years.
   - We are well ahead of the system average in terms of attainment of college level English in the first year.
   - Our ability to quickly pivot to online learning at the onset of the pandemic is a reflection of our excellent eLearning department, and of our faculty who already had experience teaching online.

2. **Based on the data in this report, what are LCC's weaknesses in providing transfer education?**
   - Our male students and students receiving need-based aid are performing less well in some areas.
   - Asian student attainment of college level math within the first year is trending down.
   - Completion of college level math in the first year is below the system average for all five years of data in the report.

3. **Based on the data in this report, what are LCC's opportunities for providing students transfer education?**
   - Our Guided Pathways and instructional diversity initiatives should help reduce equity gaps in the classroom.
   - Through Guided Pathways, we continue to work on shortening the math pathway.
   - With our new program maps, which are scheduled to go live in summer quarter, we have an opportunity to improve our advising effectiveness.

4. **Based on the data in this report, what are LCC's threats for providing students transfer education?**
   - COVID is an ongoing threat. Hopefully the vaccine will help us get back to a more "normal" environment before the variant of the virus takes hold.
   - Many college students are in need of greater financial support, and we are hopeful that federal funding opportunities for college students will improve.
   - Declining enrollment is a potential threat, since enrollment affects our budget, and our budget affects everything we do.
   - Changing course delivery models, with the shift to increased online learning, present both an opportunity and a threat. It is clear that we are not just going to return to doing everything the way we were before the pandemic. There is a lot of uncertainty.

Board Plus/Delta

"What is good about this report and what would you like to see changed?"

+	Δ